

A Note on *vinaya**

The word *vinaya* is well known in Buddhist circle as the “norm of conduct” in general and as a name of the Tripiṭakas in particular. The word is originally a verbal action noun (nomina actionis) formulated out of the verbal root *vi-nī-* which means “drive out”, or “remove”. Thus, the original meaning of the word *vinaya* is the act of driving out or removal. This meaning is preserved in Pali, as is seen in such compounds as *pipāsa-vinaya* (removal, or quenching of thirst),¹ *kodha-vinaya* (removal, or repression of anger), etc. Apparently, its application to the disciplinary meaning in the Vinaya texts is a later development through the “removal” of immoral thought and evil actions. Yet, on the other hand, in Classical Sanskrit literature the meaning of “removal” is also developed in another direction and appears in an erotic context, which is hardly compatible with the moral and disciplinary one. Under such circumstances, it might be interesting to investigate how far its semantic field is extended in Pali as well as in Sanskrit, and to locate the Buddhist meaning within it.

However, according to the nature of the material which the present writer has been able to collect so far, it is convenient to deal with the problem in two sections. In the first section, we shall examine its wide range of usage, extending from erotics to ethics in Sanskrit as well as in Pali, and in the second, we shall discuss the meaning peculiar to Sanskrit.

It is out of great respect for the scholarship of Mr K.R. Norman that the present writer takes up the word *vinaya* and dedicates it to his Festschrift.²

*This is an abridged, revised, English version of my paper in Japanese entitled “Vinaya Study”, published in *The Journal of the International College for Advanced Buddhist Studies* 7 (2004) pp. 217–70.

¹A II 34,25, Ja III 290,26. Cf. also *pipāsa-vinayana* in Mil 318,25–27.

²In fact, the present writer was inspired by an article by Mr Norman (1993).

I. *vinaya* in Pāli and Sanskrit

For clarity's sake, let us start with its usage in the erotic context.

I.1. Removal of a Garment (in an erotic context)

In sharp contrast to its moral meaning of “the rule of conduct”, the word appears in an erotic context. Two examples suffice to illustrate the situation.

*uttarīya-vinayāt trapamāṇā rundhatī kila tad-ikṣaṇa-mārgam
āvāriṣṭa vikaṭena vivoḍhur vakṣasaiva kuca-maṇḍalam anyā.*

Śiśupālavadha 10.42

Another woman, ashamed of the removal of her upper garment (*uttarīya-vinaya*) [by the hand of her husband, with the intention of] obstructing the line of his sight, covered her plump breasts by means of the broad chest of her husband.³

It is because of shyness to disclose her breasts that a woman wishes to have the tight embrace of her husband.

A similar use is also seen in its verbal usage (*vinayat-*).

*ambaram vinayataḥ priya-pāṇer yoṣitaś ca karayoḥ kalahasya
vāraṇām iva vidhātum abhikṣṇam kakṣyayā ca valayaiś ca
śiśiṅje.*

Śiśupālavadha 7.57

Girdle and bracelets twanged incessantly to ward off, so to speak, a quarrel between the beloved's hand [which tries to] remove her garment.

It is remarkable that the word *vinaya* is used in the sense of the removal of a garment (*uttarīya-*, *ambara-*) of a woman in love-making by the hand of her lover.⁴

³*kucāmśukākaraṣaṇa*: (Mallinātha) “slipping off of garment covering her breasts”.

⁴Another example is taken from a romantic context, though not so erotic. Here the etymological meaning of “removal” (*vi-* and *nī-*) can be observed.

*vinayati sudṛśo dṛśaḥ parāgaṃ praṇayini kausumam ānanānilena
tad ahita-yuvater abhikṣṇam akṣṇor dvayam api roṣa-rajobhir āpupūre.*

Śiśupālavadha 7.57

1.2. Removal of physical difficulties

As we have the Pali compound *pipāsa-vinaya* in A II 34.25 or *pipāsā-vinayana* in Mil 318.25-27, so we have *tṛṣṇā-vinayana* in MBh.

1.2.1. *tṛṣṇā*- (thirst)

Regretting what he has done, the old king Dhṛtarāṣṭra says as follows:

caturthe niyate kāle kadācid api cāṣṭame
tṛṣṇā-vinayanaṃ bhuñje gāndhārī veda tan mama.

MBh.15.5.10

Now at the fixed time, that is, at the fourth division of the day or sometimes at the eighth division, I take a little for quenching my thirst (*tṛṣṇā-vinayana*). [My wife] Gāndhārī knows this.

1.2.2. *adhva-śrama* (fatigue)

āsīnānāṃ surabhīta-śilaṃ nābhi-gandhair mṛgāṇām
tasyā eva prabhavam acalaṃ prāpya gauraṃ tuṣāraiḥ
vakṣyasy adhva-śrama-vinayane tasya śṛṅge niṣaṇṇaḥ
śobhāṃ śubhra-trinayana-vṛṣotkhāta-paṅkopameyām.

Meghadūta 52

When thou hast come to the source of that river, the mountain white with hoar-frost, where seated deer perfume the rocks with must, settle on its peak to relieve the weariness of thy journey (*śrama-vinayana*), and thou shalt assume beauty that matches clay cast up on himself by Shiva's lustrous bull.

Tr. Edgerton

1.2.3. *kapola-kaṇḍu* (the itch of the temple [of an elephant])

In describing the Mt. Himalaya, it is said,

kapola-kaṇḍūḥ karibhīr vinetuṃ
vighaṭṭitānām sarala-drumāṇām

While a lover was removing (*vinayati* = *apanayati* (Mallinātha)) the pollen of a flower from the eye of the charming-eyed one by means of his mouth-breath, both eyes of her rival-lady were immediately filled with the dusts (passion: *rajas*) of [jealous] anger.

*yatra sruta-kṣīratayā prasūtaḥ
sānūni gandhaḥ surabhī-karoti.*

Kumārasaṃbhava 1.9

Where the perfume arising from the milk-emitting nature of the pine trees, rubbed by elephants for allaying (*vinetum*) the itch of [their] temples, renders the summits fragrant.

1.3. Removal of mental difficulties

As we have the compound *parissaya-vinaya* (dispelling dangers) in Sn 92, the phrase *kaṅkhaṃ vinaya no ise* (remove our doubt, O great one) in M II 143,12⁵ and its verbal form *hadaya-pariḷāhaṃ vinaya* in Mil 318,4, the word is also construed with mental difficulty in Hindu texts.

1.3.1. *duḥkha* (grief)

Seeing the increasing number of creatures and intending to lighten the burden of the earth, Prajāpati created a girl *mṛtyu* (death) and asked her to kill the creatures. She was frightened and entreated him to relinquish his design.

*vinīya duḥkham abalā sā tv atīvāyatekṣaṇā
uvāca prāñjalir bhūtvā latevāvarjitā tadā.*

MBh.12.250.1

Having driven off her grief, the large-eyed woman said with joined hands and bending [her body] like a creeper ...⁶

1.3.2. *bhaya* (fear)

Toward the end of the great war Yudhiṣṭhira addressed Duryodhana, who hid himself in a pond, as follows,

sa tvam uttiṣṭha yudhyasva vinīya bhayam ātmanaḥ

⁵Cf. Sn 58, 559, 1025, Ja V 501,12, VI 375,20 and VI 222,15, 19, 21.

⁶ *vinīya khalu tad duḥkham āgaṃ vaimanasya-jam
dhyātavyaṃ manasā hṛdyaṃ kalyāṇaṃ saṃvijānatā.*

MBh.12.219.6

*ramasva rājan piba cādya vāruṇīm kuruṣva kṛtyāni vinīya duḥkham
mayādya rāme gamite yama-kṣayaṃ cirāya sītā vaśagā bhaviṣyati.*

R.6.63.56 Bombay

ghātayivā sarva-sainyaṃ bhrātṛiṃś caiva suyodhana (27)
nedānīṃ jīvite buddhiḥ kāryā dharma-cikīrṣayā.

MBh.9.30.28ab

Arise and fight, casting off fear for yourself! Having caused all your troops and brothers to be slain, O Suyodhana, now you should not think of [saving your] life, if you wish to do justice!

1.3.3. *jvara* (affliction)

Kumbhakarṇa encouraged his brother Rāvaṇa in distress, saying,

ramasva kāmaṃ piba cāgrya-vāruṇīṃ
kuruṣva kṛtyāni vinīyatāṃ jvaraḥ
mayādya rāme gamite yama-kṣayaṃ
cirāya sītā vaśagā bhaviṣyati.

R.6.51.47

Make love, drink wine, do what you have to do and banish affliction!

Today, when I send Rāma to the abode of death, Sītā will become yours for ever.

1.3.4. *āyāsa* (distress)

When Bharata was summoned to Ayodhyā by Kaikeyī, he saw a terrible dream and was greatly distressed.

tapyamānaṃ samājñāya vāsyāḥ priya-vādināḥ
āyāsaṃ hi vineṣyantaḥ sabhāyāṃ cakrire kathāḥ.

R.2.63.3

Observing how troubled he was, his affable companions tried to ease his distress by engaging him in conversation in the assembly hall.

Tr. Pollock

1.3.5. *hṛdaya-granthi* (knot in the heart)

As we have *hadaya-pariḷāhaṃ vinaya* (remove my heart-burning pain) in Mil 318.4, so we have the expression *granthiṃ vinīya hṛdayasya*. The sage Ātreya in the disguise of a *haṃsa* bird encouraged the Sādhyas as follows:

etat kāryam amarāḥ saṃśrutaṃ me
dhṛtiḥ śamaḥ satya-dharmānuvṛttiḥ

*granthiṃ vinīya hṛdayasya sarvaṃ
priyāpriye cātma-vaśaṃ nayīta.*

MBh.5.36.4

I have learnt, Immortals, that this is one's task; to be steady and serene and to pursue truth and Law; having undone all the knots of the heart, one should bring both the pleasant and the unpleasant under control.

Tr. van Buitenen

1.3.6. *asūya* (jealousy)

Furthermore, its verbal form takes *asūya* in the accusative case. Despite the request of Dhṛtarāṣṭra, Saṃjaya refused to speak in secret and promised to speak out only in the presence of Vyāsa and Gāndhārī.

*tau te asūyāṃ vinayetaṃ narendra
dharmajñau tau nipuṇau niścayañjñau
tayos tu tvāṃ saṃmidhau tad vadeyaṃ
kṛtsnaṃ mataṃ vāsudevārjunābhyām.*

MBh.5.65.7

For both of them, clever, knowing justice and resolute, can dispel any ill-feeling you might cherish [against me].
In their presence I shall tell you all that Kṛṣṇa and Arjuna have in their mind.

1.4. Removal of *yuddha-śraddhā*⁷

In the epic battle scene, we often meet warriors' determination to mar the warlike spirit (*yuddha-śraddhā*)⁸ of their adversary. It is natural in these contexts for *vi-nī-* to appear in the future tense, either in the simple form or in the periphrastic one.

*tiṣṭha tiṣṭha na me jīvan droṇa-putra gamiṣyati
yuddha-śraddhām ahaṃ te 'dya vineṣyāmi raṇājire.*

MBh.7.131.62

⁷Cf. Hara 1992.

⁸The literary meaning would be "the conviction (*śraddhā*) [of victory] in battle".

Wait, wait, O son of Droṇa, you shall not go [escaping] from me with your life.⁹ I shall today dispel your eagerness for fighting.

1.5. *darpa* (arrogance)

In a similar context of battle we also meet *darpa*.

*anuktvā samare tāta śūrā yudhyanti śaktiṭaḥ
sa yudhyasva mayā śaktyā vineṣye darpam adya te.*

MBh.8.17.54

Heroic men fight their utmost in the battlefield without saying anything. Thus, fight with me to the utmost. Today, I shall destroy your arrogance.¹⁰

1.6. Removal of vices (= restraint or control)

The removal of jealousy (*asūya*) and arrogance (*darpa*) leads us to that of vices in general. It is from this “removal of vices” onward that the word *vinaya* is imbued with the tinge of moral and disciplinary meaning.

⁹Hara 1996.

¹⁰v.1. *hanīṣye*, *vinaśyed* for *vineṣye*.

Cf. also,

*ekaikaśaḥ samarthāḥ smo vijetaṃ sarva-pārthivān
āgacchantu vineṣyāmi darpam eṣāṃ śītaiḥ śaraiḥ.*

MBh.5.54.19

*eṣo yotsyāmi vaḥ sarvān nivārya śara-vāgurām
tiṣṭhadhvaṃ yuddha-manaso darpam vinayitāsmi vaḥ.*

MBh.14.77.5

*śīghram eva hi rākṣasyo vikṛtā ghora-darśanāḥ
darpam asya hi vineṣyantu māṃsa-śoṇita-bhojanāḥ.*

R.3.54.24

The contrast between *darpa* and *vinaya* is also discerned in the following passages :

*tad yuddham abhavad ghoram deva-dānava-saṃkulam
kṣamā-parākrama-mayaṃ darpasya vinayasya ca.*

H.37.21

*tat surāsura-saṃyuktaṃ yuddham atyadbhutaṃ babhau
dharmādharma-samāyuktaṃ darpeṇa vinayena ca.*

H.35.3

1.6.1. In Pali text, the word *vinaya* is compounded with various kinds of vice, such as

<i>asmi-māna</i>	(the sense of ego) (Vin, I 3,30),
<i>icchā</i>	(desire) (D III 252,19–20, A IV 15,12–13, V 165,7–8),
<i>kodha</i>	(anger) (A I 91,20, A VI 65,12–13, S II 282,20),
<i>upanāha</i>	(grudge) (A I 91,20),
<i>gedha</i>	(greed) (Sn 152, 1098),
<i>makkha</i>	(hypocrisy) (A V 165,17–18, S II 282,20),
<i>māna</i>	(pride) (S II 282,20),
<i>sāṭheyyā</i>	(treachery) (A V 165,22–23),
<i>māyā</i>	(fraud) (A V 165,26–28),
<i>chanda-rāga</i>	(exciting desire) (S IV 7,9, 13–14, 19)
<i>rāga</i>	(lust) (S V 137,25, 241,24),
<i>dosa</i>	(hatred) (S V 37,25, 241,24),
<i>moha</i>	(delusion) (S V 137,26, 241,24)
<i>bhakuṭi</i>	(superciliousness) (Sn 485).

Yet, the commonest construction of *vinaya* with vices is summarized in that of *akusala dhamma* in the plural, where these three (*rāga, dosa, moha*) are also included. For example:

*ahaṃ hi Sīha vinayāya dhammaṃ desemi rāgassa dosassa
mohassa aneka-vihitānaṃ pāpakānaṃ akusalānaṃ dhammānaṃ
vinayāya dhammaṃ desemi.*

Vin I 235,26–28 ≠ III 3,9–11 = A IV 175,7–9

O Siha, I am teaching this dhamma in order to remove lust, hatred and delusion. [That is to say,] I am teaching this dhamma in order to remove evil and unfit qualities of various sorts.¹¹

1.6.2. However, in classical Sanskrit literature, these vices are mostly preceded by *vinīta-* as is seen in such compounds as *vinīta-rāga* (MBh.12.172.37), *vinīta-moha* (MBh.12.237.35), *vinīta-krodha-harṣa* (MBh.5.88.6), *vinīta-roṣa-tṛṣṇā* (MBh.12.172.36), *vinīta-kilbiṣa* (MBh.5.193.29). Of these, the commonest one is *vinītātman*.

¹¹For *samukhā-vinaya, satī-vinaya, amūḷha-vinaya*, cf. D III 254,12.

*taṃ sa-dāro vinitātmā sugrīvaḥ plavaḡādhīpaḥ
pūjyā pratījagrāha prīyamāṇas tad arhayā.*

MBh.3.266.13

With his wife, the courteous (*vinītātman*) king of apes, Sugrīva,
kindly received him with the honor due to him.

Tr. van Buitenen

1.7. Training

From the “removal” of vices, it is an easy transition of meaning to that of shortcomings in general, that is “training”. Yet, this “training” is exercised not only to human beings, but also to animals.

1.7.1. Taming of wild animals

In praise of Rāma we read,

*ārohe vinaye caiva yukto vāraṇa-vājinām
dhanurveda-vidāṃ śreṣṭho loke ‘tiratha-saṃmataḥ.*

R.2.1.23

He was proficient in riding (*āroha*) and the training (*vinaya*) of horses and elephants, and was regarded as the best expert among masters of martial arts.¹²

¹²For *vinīta-sattva*, cf.

tapasvi-saṃsarga-vinīta-sattve tapo-vane vīta-bhayā vasāsmīn.

Raghuvamśa 14.75ab

For *vinīta-mṛga*, cf.

agastyasyāśramāḥ śrīmān vinīta-mṛga-sevitaḥ.

R.3.10.84

For elephants, cf.

*vinaya-vidhāyini bhagne ‘pi cāṅkuṣe vidyata eva vyāla-vāraṇasya
vinayāya sakala-matta-mātaṅga-kumbha-sthala-sthira-śirobhāga-bhiduraḥ
kharatarāḥ kesari-nakharāḥ.*

Harṣacarita 188.14-6

*prabhinnāś ca mahānāgā vinīta hasti-sādibhiḥ
parasparaṃ samāsādyā saṃnipetus abhūtavat.*

MBh.6.91.26

*ye tv ete sumahā-nāgā añjanasya kulodbhavāḥ
idhodaka-pradātāraṃ śūnya-pālakam āśrame*

1.7.2. Training of youths

The “taming of animals” is akin to “the training” of children. Human beings in the prime of their youth should be trained and cultivated. Hence its construction with *saiśava*, *yauvana*, etc.

1.7.2.1. *saiśava*

The sage Divākaramitra praises the inborn courtesy of Harṣa as follows:

*asya tv īdṛṣe saiśave vinayasyopādhyāyaṃ dhyāyann api na
sambhāvayāmi bhuvī.*

Harṣacarita 239.25–26

In my pondering, I cannot imagine any instructor in decorum on the earth (*vinayasyopādhyāya*) in his childhood.

1.7.2.2. *śiśutva*

Mischief (*a-vinaya*) is natural to childhood. Hence its construction with *śiśutva* and *bāla-bhāva*.

janaka iva śiśutve supriyasyaika-sūnor

vinītam ācārya-kule suyuktaṃ guru-karmaṇi.

MBh.13.105.9

For horses, cf.

*aśvānāṃ prakṛtiṃ vedmi vinayaṃ cāpi sarvaśaḥ
duṣṭānāṃ pratipattiṃ ca kṛtsnaṃ caiva cikitsitam.*

MBh.4.11.7

vinayantaṃ javenāśvān mahārājasya paśyataḥ.

MBh.4.18.32

karkāśās ca vinītās ca prabhinna-karaṭāmukhāḥ.

MBh.7.87.33

For bulls, cf.

*tasmai pradeyaṃ prāyacchat prīto rājā dhanam bahu
vinītān vṛṣabhān dṛṣṭvā sahadevasya cābhibho.*

MBh.4.12.31

*tathānaḍvāhaṃ brāhmaṇyātha dhuryaṃ
dattvā yuvānaṃ balinaṃ vinītam
halasya voḍhāram ananta-vīryaṃ
prāpnoti lokān daśadhenudasya.*

MBh.13.72.43

avinayam api sehe pāṇḍavasya smarāriḥ.

Kirātārjunīya 17.64cd

Śiva put up with Arjuna's indecorum (*avinaya*), as a father puts up with his loving single son in his childhood.¹³

1.7.2.3. *yauvana*

Youth and decorum are often incompatible. In the praise of Mādhavagupta we read,

paraspara-viruddhayor vinaya-yauvanayos cirāt prathama-saṅgama-cihnam iva bhrū-saṅgatakena kathayantam ...

Harṣacarita 139.20

His meeting brows seemed to suggest the reconciliation after a long time of those irreconcilables, youth and decorum ...

1.7.2.4. *abhinava-yauvana*

avinaya-bahulatayā cābhinava-yauvanasya ...

Kādambarī 270.5

Since the prime of youth (*abhinava-yauvana*) is full of ill-behaviour or mischief (*avinaya*) ...

1.8. Education

Cultivation of youths is nothing but “education”. As we have *abhidhamme vinesi* (“taught in the Abhidhamma”) in Mil 12,19, 13,19–20, the word has the meaning of education.

1.8.1. Martial arts

pūrvam ahar-bhāgaṃ hasty-aśva-ratha-praharaṇa-vidyāsu

¹³ *sa evaiṣa punaḥ svayaṃkṛtenāvinayena ...*

Kādambarī 578.9

avinaya-niścetano nakha-pratibimbitam ātmānaṃ bahu manyate.

Kādambarī 410.7

As for *bāla-bhāva*, see H.2.51.1-2 and 4 (Bombay) which is paraphrased by *putra-durnaya* in H.2.51.3. Cf. also Harṣacarita 78.11 where an elephant-charmer gives instruction to a youth while scolding a young elephant “give up fickleness (*lolatā*) and practise courtesy (*vinaya-vrata*)”.

kari-kalabha vimuñca lolatāṃ cara vinaya-vratam ānatānaḥ.

Harṣacarita 78.11

vinayaṃ gacchet.

KAS.1.5.12

During the first part of the day, he (the prince) should undergo training in the arts of [using] elephants, horses, chariots and weapons.

Tr. Kangle¹⁴

1.8.2. Arts (*kalā*)

In enumerating the education of the courtesans, we read,

nṛtya-gīta-vādiya-nāṭya-citrāsvādyā-gandha-puṣṭakalāsu lipi-jñāna-vacas-kausālādīṣu ca saṃyag-vinayanam.

Daśakumāracarita 81.2-3

Proper training in dancing, singing, musical instruments, theatre, painting, cooking, perfume, flower-arrangement ...¹⁵

1.9. Courtesy and Decorum

As the result of training and education, a youth learns how to behave, and becomes modest and courteous. The meaning of “moral discipline” is now well-established in Hinduism. The Nītivākyāmṛta defines it as follows:

vrata-vidyā-vayo 'dhikeṣu nīcāir ācaraṇaṃ vinayam (6)

¹⁴Cf. KAS.9.2.24 (*praharaṇa-vidyā-vinītaṃ tu kṣatriya-balaṃ śreyah*). Cf. also MBh.6.15.41 (*sarvāstra-vinayopeta*) and MBh.1.181.15 (*śastrāstra-vinaya*). Furthermore,

*viśeṣārthī tato bhīṣmaḥ pauṭrāṇāṃ vinayepsayā
iṣv-astra-jñān paryapṛcchad ācāryān vīrya-saṃmatān (1)
nālpa-dhīr nāmahābhāgas tathā-nānāstra-kovidāḥ
nādeva-sattvo vinayet kurūn astre mahā-balān.*

MBh.1.121.2

*gadāsi-carma-grahaṇeṣu śūrān astreṣu śikṣāsu rathāśva-yāne
saṃyag vinetā vinayaty atandrīs tāṃś cābhimanyuḥ satataṃ
kumāraḥ*

MBh.3.180.28

¹⁵Cf.

*sā rājā-haṃsair iva saṃmatāṅgī gateṣu līlāñcita-vikrameṣu
vyanīyata pratyupadeśa-lubdhair ādīsubhir nūpura-siñjītāni.*

Kumāra-saṃbhava 1.34

*pun̄yāvāptiḥ śāstra-rahasya-parijñānaṃ sat-puruṣābhigamyam
ca vinaya-phalam*

Nītvākyāmṛta 11.7

Vinaya is to behave humbly toward those who are advanced in religious observance (*vrata*), knowledge (*vidyā*)¹⁶ and age (*vayas*).¹⁷

The fruits thereof are the attainment of religious merit, insight into the secrets of scriptures and association with good people.¹⁸

But in Hindu political literature, this quality is particularly desirable for the education of the young prince.¹⁹

*tebhyo 'dhigacched vinayaṃ vinītātmāpi nityaśaḥ
vinītātmā hi nṛpatir na vinaśyati karhi cit.*

MS.7.39

Let him, though he may already be modest (*vinītātmā*), constantly learn modesty (*vinaya*) from them (the elders); for a king who is modest never perishes.

Tr. Bühler²⁰

In describing Rāma and his brothers, it is said,

*svābhāvikaṃ vinītatvaṃ teṣāṃ vinaya-karmaṇā
mumūrcha sahaḥ tejo haviṣeva havir-bhujām.*

Raghuvamśa 10.79

Their inborn courtesy²¹ became stabilized²² by education,²³ as

¹⁶Cf. KAS.1.5.11: *nityaś ca vidyā-vṛddha-samyogo vinaya-vṛddhy-artham, tanmūlatvād vinayasys.*

¹⁷Though the first chapter of KAS is called *vinayādhikārika* “the topic of training” (Kangle), “von Sachen der Erziehung und des Wohlverhaltens” (Meyer), there is no definition of the word *vinaya* as such.

¹⁸Cf. Kane 51–52 and Botto 82–83.

¹⁹For king and *vinaya*, cf. Kane III 51–53.

²⁰For its opposite *avinītaś ca duṣṭātmā*, cf. MBh.4.20.25.

²¹The youth of a noble-family is courteous by birth. Hence the expressions *svābhāvika vinītatva* here, and *svabhāva-vinīta* in R.2.17.13 and *vinaya sahaja* in Uttararāmacarita 4.22.

²²Cf. Hara 2000C.

²³For the inborn courtesy and later education, cf. *kṛtaka* and *svābhāvika* in

the innate splendour of fire becomes strengthened by clarified butter.²⁴

1.10. *a-vinaya* (insolence, mischief)

In the story of retribution we meet often the word *avinaya*. Ugly-looking Kabandha tells Lakṣmaṇa the story of his previous life.

*virūpaṃ yac ca me rūpaṃ prāptaṃ hy avinayād yathā
tan me śṛṇu naravyāghra tattvataḥ śaṃsatas tava.*

R.3.66.15

Listen, tiger among men, truly I shall tell you why my form was deformed through an act of insolence.

Also in Kādambarī we read,

*tad yaḥ sa kāmopahata-cetāḥ svayaṃ-kṛtād evāvinayād divya-
lokataḥ paribhraśyan martya-loke vaiśampāyana-nāmā
śukanāsa-sūnur abhavad.*

Kādambarī 578.8–9

Stupefied by love, he fell from heaven to the mortal world because of his own mischief, and was born as the son of Śukanāsa with the name of Vaiśampāyana.²⁵

1.11. In the above, we have surveyed step by step the various aspects of *vinaya*, whose original meaning is “removal”. The original meaning is apparently characterized by the “disjunctive” function of the prefix *vi-*, and the usual meanings of “modesty” and “moral discipline” are later developed in the course of its association with vices in general. Next we shall proceed to its special meaning in Sanskrit literature.

KAS.1.5.3-5.

²⁴For other expressions “modest” and “courteous”, cf. *vinayānvita* (MBh. 13.76.1), *vinayopeta* (MBh.12.285.38, 14.35.18) and *vinaya-saṃpanna* (MBh.1.106.14, 2.5.29, 6.27.17). For *vinīta-veśa* (soberly dressed), cf. MS.8.2.

²⁵For the adjectives *avinīta* (-putra), cf. MBh.5.133.9, KAS.1.17.51 and for *durvinīta*, cf. R.3.18.9, 7.53.18, 7.30.34.

2. Its particular use in Sanskrit

2.1. *vi-naya* in the sense of the absence of *naya*.

Beside its disjunctive function, the prefix *vi-* indicates absence (*yoga: viyoga*) or reverse (*kraya: vikraya*). As a result, it is possible for *vi-naya* to mean the absence of *naya*. It is this possibility of which the skilled writers in Kāvya took advantage and succeeded in composing a verse with the double-entendre. We shall see the skill of Māgha in his Śīsupālavadha, where a verse can be read in the two ways of praise and blame.

ahitād anapatrapas trasann atimātrojjhita-bhīr anāstikaḥ
vinayopahitas tvayā kutaḥ sadṛśo 'nyo guṇavān avismayaḥ.
 Śīsupālavadha 16.7

2.1.1. The first meaning, in the good sense:

Where is someone else virtuous (*guṇavat*) equal to you, possessed of decorum (*vinayopahita*), afraid of (*trasan*) evils (*ahita*), prudent (*an-apa-trapa*), yet tremendously brave (*ujjhita-bhī*), pious (*a-nāstika*) and without arrogance (*avismaya*)?

2.1.2. The second meaning, in the bad sense (*paruṣa*):

Where is someone else unvirtuous (*aguṇavat*) equal to you, afraid of the enemy (*ahita = śatru*), shameless (*an-apatrapa = nirlajja*), cowardly (*nati-mātrojjhita-bhī*) (literally, “escaping fear only by obeisance” = “without fighting bravely”), an atheist (*an-āstika*), without policy, and yet arrogant?

According to Mallinātha, here the compound *vinayopahita* in the first reading is *vinayenānauddhatyenopahito viśiṣṭa*, taking *vinaya* in the sense of *anauddhatya* (freedom from pride, modesty).

In the second reading, the compound is divided as *vinayo 'pahita*, and *vinaya* is used in the sense of *nayātīto* (gone beyond good policy (*naya*), that is, neglected policy) and *apahita* is taken in the sense of *hitād apetaḥ* (deviating from the beneficial).²⁶

²⁶For other word-play of *a-naya*, *vi-naya*, cf.

tasya tat prāpya duṣprāpyam aiśvaryaṃ muni-satḥtam

2.2. *vinaya* as a repetition of *naya*

The repetition of a word with its prefix is not uncommon in Pali,²⁷ but it appears also in Epic Sanskrit.²⁸ For example, the prefix *upa-* is used in *vana*, *upa-vana*, *diś*, *upa-diś* and also in *niśad*, *upa-niśad*.²⁹ People often translate *upa-vana* as “small wood”, and *upa-diś* as “intermediate quarter”. The same is also the case with the prefix *vi-*, for we have such examples as *diś*, *vi-diś*, *dhātā*, *vi-dhātā*, *jñāna*, *vi-jñāna* and, here including *naya*, *vi-naya*. We notice that in addition to the “disjunctive” function, the prefix *vi-* here has a function of “differentiation”. We shall see examples below.

2.2.1. *diś* and *vi-diś*

*sā rāja-bhuja-nirmuktā nirmuktoraga-saṃnibhā
prajvālayanti gaganam diśaś ca vidiśas tathā
droṇāntikam anuprāptā diptāsyā pannagī yathā.*

MBh.7.81.31

The spear (*śakti*), hurled from the king’s arm, reached close to Droṇa, burning the sky and various quarters, like a female snake with gleaming mouth which has just cast off her skin.³⁰

*dīpo yathā nirvṛtim abhyupeto naivāvaniṃ gacchati nāntarikṣam
diśam na kāṃcid vidiśam na kāṃcit sneha-kṣayāt kevalam eti
śāntim.*

Saundarananda 16.28

vibabhrāma matis tāta vinayād anayāhatā.

H.20.28

For *naya*, *apa-naya*, *vi-naya*, cf.

*vinayam guṇā iva vivekam apanaya-bhidaṃ nayā iva
nyāyam avadhaya ivāśaraṇāḥ śaraṇam yayuḥ śivam atho mahṛṣayaḥ.*

Kirātārjunīya 12.17

²⁷Cf. Allon 199 note and 248 (*kampati*, *saṃkampati*, *sampakampati*) and Dhadhphale 217 (*neti*, *vineti*, *anuneti*), 222 (*kampi*, *saṃkampi*, *sapakampi*), 225 (*jhāyanti*, *pajjhāyanti*, *nijjhāyanti*, *apajjhāyanti*).

²⁸Hara 2000A.

²⁹Hara 2000B.

³⁰Cf. MBh.13.151.27, H.31.37, R.6.66.27.

Just as a lamp, which has reached the stage of extinction, does not depart to the earth or the sky or any of the quarters or intermediate quarters but from exhaustion of the oil merely goes out.

Tr. Johnston³¹

As Johnston takes it, the word *vi-diś* means the intermediate quarters, differentiating the preceding word *diś*.

2.2.2. *śeṣa-*, *viśeṣa*

rājño 'pi vāso-yugam ekam eva kṣut-saṃnirodhāya tathānna-mātrā

śayyā tathaikāsanam ekam eva śeṣā viśeṣā nṛpater madāya.

Buddhacarita 11.48

A king too can only wear one pair of garments and similarly take only a certain measure of food to still his hunger: so he can only use one bed, only one seat. The other luxuries of a king lead only to the intoxication of pride.

Tr. Johnston

Here Johnston takes *śeṣā viśeṣā* as “the other (*śeṣa*) luxuries (*viśeṣa*) (of a king)”, but one may interpret the second word *vi-śeṣa* as a specification or differentiation of *śeṣa*. Then *śeṣa, viśeṣa* means “the rest”, or “the various remainings, large and small”.

2.2.3. *dhātā-*, *vidhātā*³²

These two are often rendered into “creator” and “distributor”, but we may take them in the sense of “various gods”. In enumerating the gods who attended the rite of the royal consecration of Skanda Kārtikeya, the text says,

*indrā-viṣṇū mahā-vīryau sūryā-candramasau tathā
dhātā caiva vidhātā ca tathā caivānilānalau.*

MBh.9.44.4

Indra and Viṣṇu of great energy, similarly the sun and moon, and *dhātṛ* and *vidhātṛ*, wind and fire³³ ...

³¹Cf. Saundarananda 16.29.

³²Cf. Durga ad Nirukta 11.11 (*dhātaiva vidhātā*) as quoted in Dhadphale 223.

³³Cf. MBh.7.69.46, 13.15.31, 13.145.39 (*sa dhātā vidhātā ...*), 3.249.4 (*dhātur*

The gods here enumerated (the sun and moon, wind and fire) compose the typical pairs, and we do not need to take the second *vidhātṛ* in the sense of “distributor”. Here *dhātā*, *vidhātā* simply means “various gods”.

2.2.4. *jñāna*-, *vijñāna*

As is well-known, F. Edgerton proposed to translate *jñāna* as “theoretical knowledge” and *vijñāna* as “practical knowledge”.³⁴ Thus he translated, for example,

*tasmāt tvam indriyāṅy ādau niyamy bharatarṣabha
pāpmānaṃ prajahi hy enaṃ jñāna-vijñāna-nāśanam.*

BhG.3.41

Thou, therefore, the senses first controlling, O bull of Bharatas, smite down this evil one, that destroys theoretical and practical knowledge.

Tr. Edgerton³⁵

But we may take them in a similar way, taking them simply as “various sorts of knowledge”.

2.2.5. *naya*-, *vi-naya*

Now we come to *naya vinaya*.³⁶ As *diś*-, *vi-diś* mean “quarters and

vidhātṛ), 12.224.49 (*dhātāiva vidadhāty uta*), R.7.20.24 (*yo vidhātā ca dhātā ca sukrte duṣkrte tathā*).

³⁴Edgerton 1933.

³⁵Cf. BhG 6.8, MS.9.41: *tat-prājñena vinītena jñāna-vijñāna-vedinā*.

³⁶Of course, we would not entirely exclude the meaning of “modesty” for *vinaya*, even when it appears in conjunction with *naya*. For example,

*vipanne ca samārambhe saṃtāpaṃ mā sma vai kṛthāḥ
ghaṭate vinayas tāta rājñām eṣa nayaḥ paraḥ.*

MBh.12.56.16

Even when some undertaking has failed, do not grieve! [In such a case] modesty (*vinaya*) is proper (to be followed), for modesty is the highest policy (*naya*) of kings.

We have mentioned above that courtesy (*vinaya*) is indispensable for the education of princes.

intermediate quarters”, that is “various quarters” as a whole,³⁷ so *naya-*, *vi-naya* may mean “various *naya* (policy, stratagems)”, instead of “policy and modesty”. Below we shall list some examples where *vinaya* is used in this sense.

2.2.5.1. In the self-praise of Kaṁsa, we read,

*ahaṁ balena vīryena nayena vinayena ca
prabhāveṇaiva śauryeṇa tejasā vikrameṇa ca
satyena caiva dānena nānyo 'sti sadṛśaḥ pumān.*

H.2.28.113 Bombay = H.73.822*7-9

Nobody is equal to me with respect to power, energy, majesty, [using] various stratagems, heroism, splendour, courage, truthfulness and giving.³⁸

2.2.5.2. In describing Kṛṣṇa, we read,

*manuṣyāṇāṃ mano-bhūtas tapo-bhūtas tapasvinām
vinayo naya-vṛttānām tejas tejasvinām api.*

H.30.36

He is the [true]³⁹ mind of men, and the [true] asceticism of the ascetics, *vinaya* of *naya-vṛttas*, and the splendour of the splendidous.⁴⁰

Though we have here *vinaya* metri causa, otherwise we might expect *naya-bhūta* in parallel with *mano-bhūta*, *tapo-bhūta* in the first line, or *naya* with *tejas* in *pada* d. In this context, it is not necessary to take *vinaya* as being independent of *naya* in the sense of “modesty”, or “moral discipline”, but “the [true] *naya* of *naya-vṛttas* (the true [= distinctive] policy among politicians)”.

³⁷We have similar constructions in *diś-*, *upa-diś-*, *pra-diś-*, *pratidiś-* also.

³⁸Except for *satya* and *dāna* in the last line, all the items enumerated in the first two lines are concepts of a military and heroic nature. If so, *vinaya* in the first line is not necessarily to be taken in the sense of “modesty”, but goes together with *naya* in the sense of “various” *nayas*.

³⁹Here I take *-bhūta* in the sense of “true”, as is the case with *caitya-bhūta* and *kumāra-bhūta*. Cf. Schopen.

⁴⁰Cf. Vāyu-purāṇa 97.42 which has *vinayo naya-tṛptānām* in c.

2.2.5.3. In his monologue, Yaugandharāyaṇa says as follows :

*vairam bhayaṃ paribhavaṃ ca samaṃ vihāya
kṛtvā nayaś ca vinayaś ca śaraś ca karma
śatroḥ śriyaṃ ca suhṛdām ayaśaś ca hitvā
prāpto jayaś ca nṛ-patiś ca mahāṃś ca śabdaḥ.*

Pratijñāyaugandharāyaṇa 4.6

[For I,] disregarding enmity, fear, and insult alike, have accomplished my work with my designs, by self-control and arrows, ending the glory of the foe and the disgrace of my friends. Thereby have I won victory, the king himself, and great renown.

Tr. Woolner

Though Woolner takes *naya* in the sense of “design” and *vinaya* “self-control”, we may take them in the sense of various sorts of *naya* (stratagem, tactic), the diplomatic means, both of which are contrasted to *śara* (arrow), the military means.⁴¹

2.2.5.4. Similarly,

*śilena sāmṇā vinayena sītāṃ
nayaṇa na prāpsyasi cen narendra
tataḥ samutsādaya hema-puñkhair
mahendra-vajra-pratimaiḥ śaraughaiḥ.*

R.3.6I.16

If you cannot recover Sītā by peaceful means (*śila*), by conciliation (*sāman*), tact (*vinaya*), or diplomacy (*naya*), lord of men, then unleash the flood of your gold-feathered arrows, as devastating as great Indra’s thunder-bolts.

Tr. Pollock

⁴¹Apparently, the second line refers to the various means of defeating an enemy. According to the *nīti* literature, the means (*upāya*) consists of peaceful tactics (*sāman*, *dāna*, and *bheda*) and violent means (*daṇḍa*). In the above verse, *naya*, *vinaya* correspond to peaceful means, while *śara* to the violent one.

Pollock rightly takes *vinaya* as “tact”. Here again the second line refers to arrows, a violent means, whereas the first line refers to peaceful diplomatic means.⁴² Under such circumstances, we do not necessarily take the words *naya* and *vinaya* literally, that is, in the sense of “tactics” and “self-control”.

3. Other special meanings

Apart from *vi-* with the “disjunctive” and “differentiating” function, we shall list below three special meanings of *vinaya* as induced from context and commentary literature.

3.1. *vinaya* in the sense of *nigāḍa* (fetter)

In the *Pratijñāyugandharāyaṇa*, a chamberlain tells Pradyota how Vatsa is as a captive as follows:

*kāñcukīyaḥ — āhita-vinayatvāt pādayor aṅge tasya bahu-
prahāratvāc ca skandha-vāhyena śayanīyena madhyama-gr̥he
praveśitaḥ.*

Pratijñāyugandharāyaṇa 2.13.10-11

Chamberlain: He was so tractable and had so many wounds on his feet and body, that he was carried into the Middle Palace on a litter.

Tr. Woolner

Though Woolner translated *āhita-vinaya* as “tractable”, here the compound should be taken in the sense of “having fetters placed”, as Ganapatisastri commented (*āhita-vinayatvād vinīyate ‘nenāparādhīti vinaya iha nigalaḥ, sa āhito niveśito yasya sa āhita-vinayaḥ*). Here the passage describes king Vatsa as a captive, having his feet and body fettered as a criminal (*aparādhin*).

⁴²As is well known, *sāman* (conciliation), *dāna* (bribery), *bheda* (sowing dis-sension) and *daṇḍa* (open attack) are means of success against an enemy (MS.7.109, KAS.7.16.3). Here the first line corresponds to peaceful means and *śara* in the second line to violent means. Cf. also, MBh.12.223.8, R.2.37.5, 4.17.28, 4.18.8, R.6.128.82 (Bombay), H.2.28.113 (Bombay).

3.2. *vinaya* as contrasted to *visarga*

Bhīṣma enumerates various aspects of *daṇḍa*, the rod of punishment.

*aśaktiḥ śaktir ity eva māna-stambhau vyayāvvyayau
vinayaś ca visargaś ca kālākālau ca bhārata.*

MBh.12.121.28

[It is] power and impotence, arrogance, obstinacy, change and stability, discipline and letting loose, the right time and the wrong time.

Tr. Fitzgerald

Since positive and negative concepts are contrasted here, *vinaya* is the reverse of *visarga* and thus *pada c* should be translated something like “restraint and freedom”.

It is interesting to note that *vinaya* which means originally “removal” here comes to mean “confinement [in fetters]” or “restraint”, nearly the reverse of its original meaning of “taking away”.⁴³

3.3. *vinīta* in the sense of *prasārīta* (stretched, strewn)

Finally, we shall examine *vinīta* in the sense of *prasārīta*. BR lists under *vi-nī-* (*ausbreiten*) an example from the Rāmāyaṇa. Prior to the well-known scene of Sītā’s abduction, she was curious about a golden deer and asked Rāma to capture it, saying:

*nihatasyāsya sattvasya jāmbūnada-maya-tvaci
śaṣpabṛsyāṃ vinītāyām icchāmy aham upāsītum.*

R.3.41.19

Were the creature to be killed, I should like his golden skin to be stretched over a cushion of straw, to make a seat.

Tr. Pollock⁴⁴

⁴³This meaning of *vinaya* as confinement and restraint may be related to that found in Pali *ariyassa vinaye*, which means “in the restricted sense of aryan”, that is, “in the Buddhist sense of the term”. However, the discussion on this subject needs another lengthy paper to be written.

⁴⁴The commentary reads as follows:

śaṣpa-bṛsyāṃ bāla-tṛṇa-parikalpita-tāpasāsane vinītāyāṃ prasārītāyām asya

Above, we have discussed *vinaya* used neither in the original sense of “removal”, nor in the ordinary sense of “discipline” in classical Sanskrit literature.⁴⁵ Finally, we shall examine an allegorical story of *vinaya* and its relationship to *lajjā*.

4. *vinaya* and *lajjā*

4.1. It is believed that *vinaya* is essential to the well-bred woman, as is expressed by the Sanskrit compound *sādhvī-vinaya*. When Hanumān extended his hand to help her, Sītā refused his offer, being afraid of touching a man’s hand other than her husband. In his praise, we read:

*yukta-rūpaṃ tvayā devi bhāṣitaṃ śubha-darśane
sadṛśaṃ strī-svabhāvasya sādhvīnāṃ vinayasya ca.*

R.5.36.2

Oh queen, charming lady, what you said is appropriate. It is suitable for womanhood (*strī-svabhāva*) and the providence (*vinaya*) of a chaste women!

4.2. So bashfulness (*lajjā*) is proper for the well-bred young lady.

*asaṃtuṣṭā dvijā naṣṭā saṃtuṣṭās ca mahābhujāḥ
salajjā gaṇikā naṣṭā nirlajjās ca kula-striyaḥ.*

Hitopadeśa 3.64

The following [four] perish: twice-borns unsatisfied, kings satisfied, bashful courtesans, and unbashful women of a noble family (*kula-stri*).

Then, how are these two, *vinaya* and *lajjā*, related to each other?

*jāmbūnada-maya-tvacy upāsītum tvat-samīpe sthātum icchāmi/yad vā
bhagavad-upāsanāṃ kartum ity arthaḥ.*

Upon a golden hide, strewn (*vinīta* = *prasārīta*) over an ascetic seat, prepared with young *kuśa* grass, I wish to sit in your side, or to serve you. That is the meaning.

⁴⁵For the meaning of *Anstandsbusse* (fine due to indecorum (*Geldstrafe bei Ungebührlichkeit*) = solatium?), cf. Meyer 291 11ff. Cf. also Nārada-smṛti 6.21d (“fine”, Lariviere translation 120).

4.3. It is in the Kūrma Purāṇa 1.8 that *vinaya* is allegorically called the son of *dharmā* and *lajjā*. Twenty-four daughters of Dakṣa are mentioned there, and thirteen of them are married to Dharma. Here, *lajjā* is enumerated as one of them, and she brought to her husband a son called *vinaya*. The relevant passage reads as follows:

*buddhyā bodhaḥ sutas tadvad apramādo vyajāyata
lajjāyā vinayaḥ putro vapuṣo vyavasāyakaḥ.*

Kūrma-purāṇa 1.8.23

Enlightenment (*bodha*) was born of intelligence (*buddhi*), so was mindfulness (*apramāda*). Decorum (*vinaya*) is the son of shame (*lajjā*), the determinant (*vyavasāyaka*) is the son of a handsome figure (*vapus*).⁴⁶

4.4. The mother-son relationship between *lajjā* and *vinaya* can be illustrated more concretely by some romantic passages of Bāṇa's Kādambarī.

4.4.1. We read:

*prāyena prathamam madanānalo lajjām dahati, tato hṛdayam/
ādau vinayādikaḥ kusumeṣu-sarāḥ khaṇḍayanti paścān
marmāṇi.*

Kādambarī 409.9–10

Generally, the love-fire first burns bashfulness (*lajjā*), and then the heart. Kāma's arrows first attack decorum (*vinaya*), and later the vital parts.

Once *lajjā* is defeated, it is an easy step for Kāma to destroy her son *vinaya*.

4.4.2. Similarly,

*skhalite cetasi tal-lagnā pataty eva lajjā/trapāvaraṇa-sūnye hṛdi
praviśya padaḥ kurvan kena vā nivārito durnivāraḥ*

⁴⁶Cf.

lajjāyā vinayaḥ putro vyavasāyo vasoḥ sutaḥ.

Līṅga-purāṇa 70.296

lajjāyā vinayaḥ putro vyavasāyo vasyoḥ sutaḥ.

Vāyu-purāṇa 10.36

sarvāvinaya-hetuḥ kusuma-dhanvā.

Kādambarī 497.6–7

When the mind stumbles, shame (*lajjā*) which clings to it falls. Into the heart devoid of its protecting cover (of *lajjā*), the flower-bannered one (Kāma) enters. Once he has entered, who can drive him away, the god who is hard to drive out and causes all sorts of indecorum (*avinaya*)?

When bashfulness is taken away, all sorts of decorum are exposed to danger.

4.4.3. In her self-reproach, the well-bred lady in love laments as follows:

yadi tāvad itara-kanyakeva vihāya lajjām, utsṛjya dhairyam, avamucya vinayaṃ, acintayitvā janāpavādam, atikramya sadācāram, ullāṅghya śīlam, avagaṇayya kulam... svayam upagamya grāhayāmi pāṇim/evaṃ guru-janātikramād adharmo mahān.

Kādambarī 297.3

If I approach by myself and grasp [his] hand [for marriage], like a common girl — abandoning shame (*lajjā*), giving up steadfastness (*dhairya*), unharnessing decorum (*vinaya*), neglecting people's rumour (*janāpavāda*), transgressing good conduct (*sadācāra*), traversing morality (*śīla*), neglecting the noble family[ness] (*kula*) ... — then, through the offence to my respected elders, there would be a great sin.⁴⁷

The urge of love-passion deprives the young lady of all the virtues.⁴⁸ All these passages illustrate the close connection of *lajjā* and *vinaya*.

Minoru Hara
Tokyo

⁴⁷Cf. Kādamabarī 354.14–355.4.

⁴⁸Besides *kāma*, *mada* (alcoholic drink) also destroys *vinaya*.

paiśūnyena kulaṃ madena vinayo duśceṣṭayā pauruṣaṃ dāridryeṇa janādaro matatayā cātma-prakāśo hataḥ.

ABBREVIATIONS

A	Aṅguttara Nikāya (PTS)
BR	O. Böhtlingk and R. Roth, <i>Sanskrit Wörterbuch</i>
D	Dīgha-nikāya (PTS)
H	The Harivaṃśa (Poona Critical Edition, unless otherwise indicated)
IS	O. Böhtlingk, <i>Indische Sprüche</i> (Osnabrück Reprint 1966)
Ja	The Jātaka, ed., by V. Fausbøll (PTS)
KAS	The Kauṭalya Artha-Śāstra, ed., by R.P. Kangle (Bombay)
MBh	The Mahābhārata (Poona Critical Edition)
Mil	Milinda-pañha, ed., by V. Trenckner (PTS)
M	Majjhima-nikāya (PTS)
MS	Manusmṛti (NSP)
NSP	Nirnaya-sagar Press (Bombay)
PTS	The Pali Text Society
R	The Vālmīki Rāmāyaṇa (Baroda Critical Edition, unless otherwise indicated)
S	Saṃyutta-nikāya (PTS)
Sn	Suttanipāta
Vin	The Vinaya-piṭaka, ed. by H. Oldenberg (PTS)
YS	Yājñavalkya-smṛti (NSP)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Allon, M., 1997. *Style and Function : A Study of the Dominant Stylistic Features of the Prose Portions of Pāli Canonical Sutta Texts and Their Mnemonic Function*, Tokyo
- Botto, O., 1962. *Nītivākyāṃṛta Somadeva Sūri*, Torino
- Dhadphale, M.G., 1980. *Synonymic Collocations in the Tipiṭaka : A Study*, Poona
- Edgerton, F. 1933. "jñāna and vijñāna", *Festschrift M. Winternitz*, Leipzig, pp. 217–20
- Hacker, P., 1978. *Kleine Schriften*, Wiesbaden, pp. 137–66
- Hara, M., 1968. "A Note on the Sanskrit Word *jana*", *Festschrift F.J.B. Kuiper*, The Hague, pp. 256–69
- 1992. "Śraddhā in the Sense of Desire", *Festschrift J. May, Asiatische Studien* 46/1, pp. 180–94

- 1996. “A Note on the Epic-Phrase *jīvan-mukta*”, *Adyar Library Bulletin* 60, pp.181–97
- 2000A. “*sāra, asāra, saṃsāra*”, *Festschrift M.A. Mehendale*, Ahmedabad, pp. 139–59
- 2000B. “Two Notes on the Word *upaniṣad* in the Mahābhārata”, *Studia Indologiczne* 7 (S. Schayer Volume), Warszawa, pp. 157–69
- 2000C. “A Note on the Compound *krodha-mūrchita*”, *Festschrift A. Mette* (Swisttal-Ordendorf 2000), pp. 343–57
- 2002. “The Hindu Concept of Friendship, A Note on Sanskrit *praṇaya*”, *Rivista degli Studi Orientali* 75 (2001), pp. 157–87
- 2004. “*śāstra* versus *śāstra*”, *Gedenkschrift J.W. de Jong*, Tokyo, pp. 49–64
- Kane, P.V., 1973. History of *Dharma-śāstra* III, 2nd ed., Poona
- Meyer, J.J., 1977. *Das altindische Buch vom Welt- und Staatsleben*, Graz Reprint
- Norman, K.R., 1993. “Theravāda Buddhism and Brahmanical Hinduism (Brahmanical Terms in a Buddhist Guise)” in *Collected Papers*, Vol. IV, Oxford, pp. 271–80
- Schopen, G., 1975. “The Phrase ‘*sa pṛthivīpradeśaś caityabhūto bhavet*’ in the Vajracchedikā: Notes on the Cult of the Book in Mahāyāna”, *Indo-Iranian Journal* 17, pp. 147–81